

PLANNING COMMITTEE

MINUTES

7 SEPTEMBER 2016

Chair: * Councillor Keith Ferry

Councillors: * Ghazanfar Ali (1) * Stephen Greek
* June Baxter * Barry Kendler
* Simon Brown (4) * Pritesh Patel

* Denotes Member present
(1), (4) Denote category of Reserve Members

265. Attendance by Reserve Members

RESOLVED: To note the attendance at this meeting of the following duly appointed Reserve Members:-

Ordinary Member

Councillor Christine Robson
Councillor Anne Whitehead

Reserve Member

Councillor Simon Brown
Councillor Ghazanfar Ali

266. Right of Members to Speak

RESOLVED: That no Members, who were not members of the Committee, had indicated that they wished to speak at the meeting.

267. Declarations of Interest

RESOLVED: To note that the following interests were declared:

Agenda Item 10 – Planning Applications Received (items 2/04 & 2/05)

Councillor Keith Ferry declared a non-pecuniary interest in that he was a trustee of the West House and Heath Robinson Museum Trust. He would remain in the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

Agenda Item 10 – Planning Applications Received (item 2/01)

Councillor Barry Kendler declared a non-pecuniary interest in that he was acquainted with the objector to this application. He would remain in the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

Agenda Item 10 – Planning Applications Received (item 2/07)

Councillor Barry Kendler declared a non-pecuniary interest in that he was Ward Councillor for Edgware where Stag Lane School was located. He would remain in the room whilst the matter was considered and voted upon.

268. Minutes

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the meeting held on 20 July 2016 be taken as read and signed as a correct record.

269. Public Questions

RESOLVED: To note that no public questions were put, or petitions or deputations received.

270. References from Council and other Committees/Panels

RESOLVED: To note that there were none.

RESOLVED ITEMS

271. Representations on Planning Applications

RESOLVED: That in accordance with the provisions of Committee Procedure Rule 30 (Part 4B of the Constitution), representations be received in respect of items 2/01, 2/03, 2/04, 2/05 on the list of planning applications.

272. 2/01 & 2/02: Cowmans Cottage, OLD CHURCH LANE, STANMORE - REFERENCE: P/2866/16 & REFERENCE: P/3122/16

REFERENCE: P/2866/16

PROPOSAL: Single storey side extension; replacement windows to side elevation; installation of 1.8M high railings and fence to side and rear boundary; lowering courtyard and new retaining walls; external alterations (demolition of cowshed).

REFERENCE: P/3122/16

PROPOSAL: Replacement single storey side extension including an increase in height; extension and alteration to the scullery to become the link; alteration to north lobby of the cottage to remove windows and door to be set aside for reuse and removal of brick and plaster infill; installation of 1.8m high railings and fence to side and rear boundary; lowering courtyard and new retaining walls; repairs to the existing garden wall.

Following a brief introduction to the reports, officers responded to Members' questions and comments as follows:

- the proposed glazing, was not inconsistent with a historic building, would maintain the existing open design of the cowshed and the degree of overlooking would be offset by the likely limited occupation. The architects had opted for glazing to the elevation of the new cowsheds following guidance and advice from both English Heritage and the Local Planning Authority;
- the details of the sale agreement of Cowmans Cottage (which had been sold by Harrow Council in 2012), were not available at the meeting and in any case, they were not a material planning consideration and therefore had not been included in the planning assessment. It was important to note that the original sale conditions allowed for far more extensive changes to the property than was currently proposed in the application;
- there was insufficient space in the current layout of the cowsheds for the new proposed use and the proposed extension would therefore have an increased height of 500mm above the existing ridge line. This increase in height had been decided following consideration of all other possible alternatives and was the best possible option under the circumstances. It was important to note that the building was affected by subsidence, which meant that the current roofline was lower than previously;
- a S.215 enforcement notice or an urgent works notice could be served on the property, however the first would require minimal works to be carried and neither type of enforcement action would resolve the issue of extensive dilapidation of the property. Furthermore, there were no obvious sources of finance available to fully restore the buildings;
- the Network Team, who were responsible for dealing with any traffic and parking related issues during the building works, (which were covered by the Construction Method Statement), would be consulted;
- supporting documents to the application showed that historic materials would be re-used where possible. However, estimates of what proportion of materials used would be historic could only be made once the site had been deconstructed. Under condition 8, these materials

would need to be made available for on-site inspection by the Council's Conservation Team;

- the Heritage Impact Assessment indicated that excavations at the site would not cause harm to the listed wall or its foundations.

A Member proposed a motion for refusal, which was withdrawn in favour of a motion to defer the item, pending further information from the architects.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Lesley De Meza and from the applicant, Lara Oyesanya.

DECISION: DEFERRED, in order to request further information and more detailed drawings from the architects.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to defer the application was unanimous.

273. 2/03: Shaftesbury Playing Field, GRIMSDYKE ROAD, HATCH END - REFERENCE: P/2872/16

PROPOSAL: Installation of Six 12.0m High Floodlight Columns

Following a brief introduction to the report, officers responded to Members questions and comments as follows:

- the playing fields were used for both training and matches;
- the previous application had been refused and under the current application, the height of proposed floodlights had been reduced by 3m and would be fitted with rear louvres. This would mitigate any undue harm to the adjacent Pinnerwood Park Estate Conservation Area.

Members agreed that the following additional condition requiring details of the proposed electronic cabinet, including proposed plans and elevations be submitted to, and approved by the local planning authority, be included in the list of conditions.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Sharon Edwards and from the applicant, Robin Greenwood.

DECISION: The Committee agreed the reasons for approval as set out in the officer report and granted planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1, of the officer report, and the additional condition above, agreed at the meeting.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

**274. 2/04 & 2/05 West House Cafe, WEST HOUSE, WEST END LANE, PINNER
- REFERENCE: P/1792/16 & P/1796/16**

PROPOSALS:

P/1792/16: Extension of Paved Terrace with Low Timber Post and Rail Fence

P/1796/16: Retention of Existing Terrace

The Chair advised that the above applications had been deferred from the previous meeting pending a site visit, which had since been undertaken. He also advised that the officer report confirmed that the pathway in front of West House was not a Public Right of Way.

Officers responded to Members questions and comments as follows:

- the proposed fence on the west, south and east side of the terrace, would be a low post and rail fence, which would ensure that the character of the area was preserved;
- the existing terrace and proposed extension to it would not seek to change the existing pathway around West House.

Members expressed concern regarding reduced accessibility for the public to the thoroughfare in front of the café and possible health and safety issues arising from this. The Chair stated that as this was an open public space, it would be difficult to place restrictions on people's freedom of movement.

Following a proposal from a Member, it was agreed that an additional condition requiring the installation of directional signage for pathways adjacent to the proposed terrace, be added to the list of conditions.

A Member proposed refusal of item 2/04 - P/1792/16, on the following grounds:

'The proposal would fail to contribute positively to the setting and quality of the Designated Open Space and it has not been demonstrated that there are any wider benefits which would outweigh the loss of Open Space, contrary to Policies DM1 and DM18 of the Development Management Policies Local Plan (2013).'

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and lost.

The Committee received representations from an objector, Jackie Lindop and from a representative of the applicant, Cliff Lichfield.

DECISION:

2/04 The Committee agreed the reasons for approval as set out in the officer report and granted planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report, the additional condition listed above agreed at the meeting and as amended by the Addendum.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant application 2/04 was by a majority of votes.

Councillors Ghazanfar Ali, Simon Brown, Keith Ferry and Barry Kendler voted for the application.

Councillors June Baxter, Stephen Greek and Pritesh Patel voted against the application.

2/05 The Committee agreed the reasons for approval as set out in the officer report and granted planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report and as amended by the Addendum.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

275. 2/06: 20 Waverley Road, HARROW - REFERENCE: P/1808/16

PROPOSAL: Demolition of garage and erection of a single storey side to rear extension, to convert dwelling into 3 flats, including the installation of new access ramps to the front and side entrances, bin stores and off-street car parking spaces.

Following a brief introduction to the report, officers responded to Members questions and comments as follows:

- the two ground floor flats would have direct access to the gardens, while access for the upper floor flat would be along a narrow pathway at the side;
- only two off-street parking spaces were proposed as this would allow an area of soft landscaping at the front. There was sufficient on-street parking and there was currently no CPZ in the area and none was planned in the near future.

A Member proposed refusal on the following grounds:

‘This proposal is an overdevelopment, with excessive scale and insufficient parking provision, which will harm the character of the street and the amenity of neighbouring occupiers, contrary to policies DM1 and DM26 of the Local Plan (2013), CS1 of the Core Strategy (2012) and 7.4 and 7.6 of The London Plan (2016).’

The motion was seconded, put to the vote and won.

DECISION: REFUSED

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to Refuse the application was by a majority of votes.

Councillors June Baxter, Stephen Greek, Barry Kendler and Pritesh Patel voted to refuse the application.

Councillors Keith Ferry and Simon Brown voted against the motion to refuse.

Councillor Ghazanfar Ali abstained from voting.

276. 2/07: Stag Lane Infant and Junior School, COLLIER DRIVE, EDGWARE - REFERENCE: P/2840/16

PROPOSAL: Three single storey modular buildings to provide five classrooms for a temporary period of 24 months (Demolition of existing two linked modular four classroom buildings)

DECISION: The Committee agreed the reasons for approval as set out in the officer report and granted planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

277. 2/08: 29-46 Cowen Avenue, SOUTH HARROW - REFERENCE: P/2034/16

PROPOSAL: Conversion And Change Of Use of Storage Area On Ground Floor To Create One Additional Flat; External Alterations

DECISION: The Committee agreed the reasons for approval as set out in the officer report and granted planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

278. 2/09: 1-46 Cowen Avenue, SOUTH HARROW - REFERENCE: P/2791/16

PROPOSAL: External alterations to include replacement roof tiles; replacement of steel balcony and walkway railings; replacement of external communal doors and external wall insulation

DECISION: The Committee agreed the reasons for approval as set out in the officer report and granted planning permission subject to the Conditions listed in Appendix 1 of the officer report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

279. Member Site Visits

RESOLVED: To note that there were no site visits to be arranged.

280. Any Other Urgent Business

None.

(Note: The meeting, having commenced at 6.30 pm, closed at 8.22 pm).

(Signed) COUNCILLOR KEITH FERRY
Chair